

DOWNTOWN COMMISSION RESULTS

Office of the Director
50 W. Gay St.
Columbus, Ohio 43215-9040
(614) 645-7795
(614) 645-6675 (FAX)

Tuesday, May 23, 2017

77 N. Front Street, STAT Room (Lower Level)

Planning Division
50 W. Gay St.
Columbus, Ohio 43215-9040
(614) 645-8664

Downtown Commission
Daniel J. Thomas (Staff)
Urban Design Manager
(614) 645-8404
djthomas@columbus.gov

I. Attendance

Present: Steve Wittmann (Chair); Otto Beatty, Jr.; Michael Brown; Kyle Katz; Tedd Hardesty; Robert Loversidge; Jana Maniace

Absent: Mike Lusk; Danni Palmore

City Staff: Daniel Thomas; Brandan Hayes; Anthony Celebrezze III

II. Approval of the April 25, 2017 Downtown Commission Meeting Results

Motion to Approve (6-0)

III. Old Business - Certificates of Appropriateness

Case #1 17-5-1

Address: 160 South High Street / HighPoint / Blasted Barley Beer Company

Applicant: Ideal Due Diligence, Amanda Caldwell (Cincinnati)

Architect: Ilan Baldinger (Tempe, Arizona)

Property Owner: Falco Smith & Kelley Ltd.

Restaurant Owner: Barley Restaurant II LLC (Las Vegas, Nevada) – Contact Mike Rose

Request:

Certificate of Appropriateness for the finishing of retail space at High Point for Blasted Barley Beer Company CC3359.05(C)1)

Tabled from April 25 Downtown Commission Meeting

Discussion

The Commission recognized the challenge of the multiple window frontages of the proposal. They were prepared to allow interior and glass work to proceed, but were not fully satisfied with the High Street windows, particularly related to the kitchen. They felt that there was insufficient information regarding the screen – the details of its design, including the nature of the screening.

Results

Motion to approve interior and glass work but have the applicant return with details on graphics, in particular the scrim.

Case #2

Withdrawn by request

IV. New Business - Conceptual Review

Case #3 17-5-3

0:00

Address: 404 East Broad Street

First Congregational Church

Applicant G. Thomas Worley

Design Professional: Mark Schieber & Charlie Weaver, Architectural Gardens

Property Owner : First Congregational Church, United Church of Christ of Columbus, Ohio

Request:

Conceptual review of Social Justice Park that is currently surface parking.

Discussion

Tom Worley – Byers parking lot bought 7 years ago and project has been envisioned since then. Today, here with formal proposal to create a community park addressing issues of social justice. 15,000 sf park, also with opportunity for a stage, enhanced parking lot & conversion of storage facility into an activity center. Park to be named after Dr. Washington Gladden, a prominent social justice leader of Columbus with a national following. Park will complete a two block green space along north side of Broad, including Art Museum and Church. City just approved funding for the Creative Campus project as part of 2010 Downtown Strategic Plan. This project will improve the streetscape in this 4 block area. There will be underground utilities surrounding the park. Discovery District SID is developing a Placemaking initiative for the area. Construction is expected to occur by the summer of 2018. OB – congratulations to the church – this is a fantastic project. The only concern I have is safety, especially about that tall wall. TW – we are dealing with transparency issues. RL – recusing. Mark Schieber – evolution of the park design. Cornerstone of beginning of the Discovery District. Entrance to a curvilinear wall progressing from 2 to 8 feet. The top of the wall would be 4 ft. above the parking lot (the parking lot is about 32 inches higher than sidewalk grade). The park is set 2 feet below the Broad St. sidewalk. Park is only 65 ft. deep. Park is both visible, has a sense of privacy and screens the parking. Park is both a sculptural entity and a platform for permanent pieces of sculpture. Wall will be built of either polished black granite or stainless steel. Its reflection would promote interaction. There will be two fountains in the wall which will help ameliorate the sound of traffic and have symbolic value. There could be sculptural elements of Dr. Gladden and others involved in social justice. There will be sitting stones. There will be small step down terraces (6 inches at a time). OB – I'm missing seeing the wall in the illustrations. There will be lawn plus sitting areas along Cleveland. We would like to see the walk along Cleveland to meander. There will be monuments with quotations. Arches are reminiscent of the entrance to the church.

JM – geometric or organic? MS – a little of both as it relates to the museum and to CCAD. SW – I like the idea of keeping the wall a little lower. Don't block the view that goes back. Maybe the fountains should stick up above the wall. KK – go as low as you can go to block the view of parking but not too high. MS – we'd like portions of the wall to reflect people. RL – some cross sections would be helpful to show the relationship of different elevations (parking lot, wall, sunken plaza, etc.). We hope that the parking lot will eventually be made up of permeable pavers and the circles in the parking lot will be drains emptying to the park. These circles also carry the movement of the park into the parking lot. Tree lawns will also collect water. The parking lot can also become a full open plaza for temporary exhibitions and events. The carriage house (built in 1910 as a car garage for an 1850 mansion – that came down at the end of the Depression) is under consideration to be converted for an activity center. To use it, some demolition would be necessary for an expansion. TW – a community fund with the Columbus Foundation will be established, which will help determine the budget. The parking lot is shared with CCAD during the school year.

SW – who will maintain the park? Sometimes the best intentions can be hurt by lack of maintenance. TW – through an endowment. There will be a landscape service. TH – Broad St. R.O.W. – is that in any plan? There is an extra 5 ft. that is R.O.W. and we are working with the City about it. There are proposals to redevelop Broad St. related to I71-I70. Next year the state may move on this. In terms of the Broad St. ramps and reconfiguration.

OB – safety is an issue – there's a lot of foot traffic. Bring the wall down. TW – behind the wall is only 4 ft. MS – we are talking about penetrating the wall in several areas. SW – renderings look nice but they are a little hard to read. Look for a little more clarity when you come back. MB – this far exceeds the 2010 Plan.

Results

Conceptual review only.

V. New Business - Request for Certificate of Appropriateness

Case #4 17-5-4

28:50

Address: 41 S High Street

Huntington Center

Applicant and Design Professional: Design Collective, Inc.

Property Owner: Hines

Request:

Certificate of Appropriateness for the renovation (rebranding) of Huntington Center, including:

- Roof top terrace (36th Floor)
- Street level improvements – removal of planters, new benches and planters and pavers
- Green canopy roof
- Interior work not under the purview of the Commission

Discussion

DC – Continued commitment to the Huntington Center. Proposed improvements to amenity spaces including the streetscape and a rooftop patio. Working with MKSK on landscaping / detail elements. Seating benches will be added. Planters will be removed in making the entry more welcoming. New planters integrated into existing granite. Stone at this time is not specified. KK – are you concerned that these will become sleeping areas at night? A. – Will work on details to minimize skateboarding and sleeping. KK – this is for CoA – you don't have a planting plan and specific materials. What is your timing? A – looking to complete construction documents by July. KK – we could give general approval but have you come back for CoA authorization. SW – looking to plant on canopy. I think all of these things are okay KK, MB – good as concept There will be a raised paver system on the rooftop, with some recessed beds. There is a setback and a rain wall. There is parking underneath the surface, which precludes deep rooted plantings.

Results

Come back with specifics on planting and materials. Include lighting.

Case #5 17-5-5

Moved back to #6

40:40

Location: Huntington Park , North Elevation of Left Field Bleacher Building

Applicant: Ken Schnacke, President and General Manager, Columbus Clippers

Property Owner: Franklin County, Board of Commissioners

Design Professional: Outfront Media

Request:

Certificate of Appropriateness for an LED electronic message center on the north façade of the Left Field Bleacher Building at Huntington Park.

Discussion

KS – 9th year of the ballpark. Keep looking to make things better. Along with Outfront Media –to put on an electronic sign on north face of the Left Field Bleacher Building facing up Neil Ave. Talked to Nationwide Realty Investors who own the nearby Flats Two. Letter of support from NRI. 36' long and 10' high. Images to change every 7 to 8 seconds. A lot of sponsors. Will coordinate with NRI on off season shared displays at this location and Arena Plaza. Coordination in summer and winter with Blue Jackets and Clippers. Komen Race for the Cure, etc., co-promote community events. Two signs being active in the Arena District. KK – will there be static murals underneath this? KS – no, the one under submission (Budweiser for a 3 month period) will be last. RL – this should be part of the approval. KS – agreed. Can control the foot-candle power. Will also be a period when the sign is dark. (1 am to 6 am?) – working this out with NRI.

Sign will be flush to the wall. SW – talk about the nature of sponsorship. Will content be related to the ballpark? KS – not necessarily. Yes, you could see Pepsi or Bud. Income stream will help keep ticket prices low. SW - .3 foot-candles comes from the rest of the City. We have been discussing this. I'm wondering if that is the right number of us. We literally do not know the answer. Do you know what .3 fc is, walking down the street? A. - I can use a common analysis of saying "that is too bright". It will be dimmed at night. In context, the fc on infield from towers is 100 – 120 fc. It can be dimmed. SW – question to Jim Rost – what setting do you have at Arena Plaza? I don't know how many more we are going to say yes to. They must be used very carefully. JR – I don't know. With the ballpark location NRI has sensitivity as it relates to Flats II. We feel comfortable and we'll work with Ken for optimum. KK – we need to leave us some latitude in the future to evaluate and if there is a complaint that we can reconcile. JR – make a requirement that they can be adjusted. KS – we'd be happy to talk about performance, let's say, in a year. We can work with Jim and Brian and let you know where are settings end up. Dan Haines – with Arena Plaza, it was 5000 knox. That is more than the .3fc., which is roughly 3000 knox. There is an adjustability. RL – difference between huge white backgrounds and more subdued. I think it's a matter of experimenting until we know it is right. Suggest that you line it up with the eastern elevation windows. Staff, I believe they are all adjustable. KK – move to accept the proposal as submitted, but have ***the top of the sign be in line with the top lintel of the Neil Elevation*** or the bottom of the sign be in line with the bottom lintel. KS – top to top. KK – ***no future murals except for impending one.*** SW, ***revisit brightness if need be.*** MB – 2nd.

Results

Motion to approve, as ***summarized*** above. (7-0) In addition to conditions of the application new conditions are below:

- The top of the sign be in line with the top lintel of the Neil Elevation.
- There will be no future murals except for impending one.
- Brightness will be revisited in a year if need be.
- The applicant will work with Nationwide Realty Investors in terms of brightness and hours related to Flats II and to coordinating displays of the Arena Plaza LED and the Huntington Park LED in terms of Blue Jacket and Clipper seasonal displays and community events.

VI. Request for Certificate of Appropriateness – Historic Resources Commission Cases

Case #6 17-5-6 Moved up to #5

36:00

Address: 34 S. Third Street

Applicant and Design Professional : Danial Hanes, The Columbus Architectural Studio

Property Owner: Capitol Square, Ltd. Chris Ruess

Request:

Certificate of Appropriateness for the renovation 34 S. Third Street (the former Dispatch Building), including:

- New windows, particularly on the south elevation
- Mechanical equipment on roof
- Demolition of one-story rear addition

Discussion

Staff – former Dispatch Building recently listed on the Columbus Register of Historic Properties. It went up before the HRC last week and was approved. It is a historic tax credit project that has also received state approval. Dan Haines – pretty straight forward proposal, new windows back to the original size. Compatible, double hung window. Dark bronze anodized. The ticker display and the roof sign are not part of this proposal and will remain. KK – move to accept.

Results

Motion to approve (7-0)

Case #7 17-5-7

54:00

Address: 479 N. High Street

New Fuzzy's Taco

Applicant and Design Professional : Creative Architectural Solutions, Inc. Brian M. Edison

Property Owner: 473-479 N. High St. LLC Josh Greenberg

Request:

Certificate of Appropriateness for the renovation of 479 N. High St. including:

- Painting
- New Signage
- Outdoor café on Spruce Street

Discussion

Staff – located in the North Market Historic District and went before the HRC last week, where it was conditionally approved – signs were altered. From two blade signs on the corner of High and Spruce to one diagonal blade sign and from an internally illuminated sign in the rear to a painted sign with gooseneck illumination. Brian Edison – landscape area on the side (Swan St.) to be converted to sidewalk café. The building is where the property line is so the café would have to get Public Services approval. Concerns were expressed about coordination with potential development of the North Market site. The building will be repainted with shades of gray. Hardiplank will be added to the tower, windows will be covered. The blade sign will be interior illuminated signs. JM – mentioned the Short North “Postage Stamp” art installation on the north elevation – it will be removed.

MB – this is an emerging important district, stretching from the convention center and High Street back to the North Market and Park Street and potentially beyond. Events will occur where streets will be closed. 2 or 3 new hotels, parking garage. JM – the railing for the café seems generic and

plain – can it be improved? The north façade of this building is monolithic and plain. SW – would like some clarification on the outdoor area. The building is there – it’s an existing building and will be painting. It currently looks terrible., anything would be an improvement. It is too bad something fabulous won’t be going in. Should we come back to look at the sidewalk café at a later time, when area plans are solidified? DJT - There is a \$500 annual lease, I don’t know how R.O.W. would react to revoking it, or conditionally approving it based upon development issues. TH – motion to approve. JM – look at the fencing. Have staff review. JM – 2nd.

Results

Motion to approve (5-1-1) Brown – no, Loversidge - recusing

VII. Business / Discussion

Question about recent ad mural approval – see below.

Public Forum

Staff Certificates of Appropriateness have been issued since last notification (March 28, 2017)

1. 31 E. Gay St. – Pub Mahone (Irish Pub – former Jay Gumbos) – Signage
2. 20 N. High - Elia Athenian Grill – Sign
3. 248 S Fourth – Dirty Frank’s – Sidewalk Café
4. 35 W Spring (Marriott Courtyard wall)– Lamar – Apple Watch AM
5. 15 W Cherry – Outfront Media – Apple Watch AM
6. 60 E Long – Orange Barrel - – Apple Watch AM
7. 285 N Front - Orange Barrel - – Apple Watch AM
8. 43 W Long - Orange Barrel - – Apple Watch AM
9. 106 N High – Atrium Lofts – Sign
10. Pearl Alley – Corn Sculpture referral to Public Services for Farmer’s Market
11. 59-61 E Mound – Banner replacement for St. John’s Church of Christ

Next regular meeting will be on June 27, 2017, the fourth Tuesday of the month (five weeks away).

If you have questions concerning this agenda, please contact Daniel Thomas, Urban Design Manager, Planning Division at 614-645-8404.

1:11:35